Review Report Guidelines

The purpose of the review report is to demonstrate that you tried to understand the paper and also to critically review the presented proposal. If that would be a competitor of yours – what did he do right and you can learn from and what did he do wrong and you will do better. It a good exercise in compact but focused writing – a challenge even academics often face. Here are few guiding questions to help you in constructing the report. Not each question needs an answer or can be answered depending on the paper under investigation.

What is the problem that the paper addresses?

Why is this a problem? What is the motivation of the impact of the work?

Is the problem solved or merely analysed and suggested solution proposed?

What is in essence the proposed solution? What principles from networking and formal foundations it relies on?

What are the strong sides of the taken approach/offered solution/evaluation? Why can we learn from them?

What is missing/not addressed enough/wrong in the taken approach/solution/evaluation?

What would you have done differently?

What are open challenges?